



102 Roadrunner Drive
Sedona, Arizona 86336
TDD (928) 204-7102
www.SedonaAZ.gov

STAFF REPORT

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Kathy Levin, Associate Planner *KLV*
Department of Community Development

Subject: Certificate of Appropriateness
Jordan Historical Park
CA11-02 (Historic Register Nos. 01, 02, and 03)

**Meeting
Date:** August 22, 2011

The Historic Preservation Commission has the authority to review a Certificate of Appropriateness for designated Historic Landmarks in accordance with the Sedona Land Development Code, §1509 and the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Preservation Briefs. The review guidelines and criteria are outlined in Article 15, §1509.03 of the Code and included at the end of this report. References to the Secretary of Interior standards will be cited below. The Commission may render its decision based upon consistency with this criterion.

The following materials are attached for commission review:

- 1) Application for the Certificate of Appropriateness including site plan sketch, artistic rendering, photographs, and sculpture description
- 2) April 1, 2011 Letter of Intent from the Red Rock Arts Council
- 3) June 25, 2011 Letter of Support from Sedona Historical Society

Background

Case number CA 11-02 proposes to install a life-size bronze sculpture of a cowboy by local artist Susan Kliewer at Jordan Historical Park adjacent to the Walter and Ruth Jordan House. Jordan Historical Park, a local historic landmark also listed on the National Register of Historic Places, is a city park. The Sedona Historical Society (SHS) operates the historical museum at the park under the terms of a five-year Lease Agreement between the City and SHS dated June 8, 2010.

The property is located at 735 Jordan Road and is approximately 3.75- acres in size.

The entire property consists of three historic structures: the House constructed in 1931 of wood and Sedona red sandstone with two additions in 1937 and 1947; the fruit Packing Shed constructed in 1946 of poured concrete veneer in Sedona red sandstone with three additions in 1950, 1998-99, and 2009; and the Tractor Shed constructed in 1934 entirely of wood.

This property was originally homesteaded in 1914 and later acquired by Walter Everett Jordan and Ruth Wolff Jordan, pioneer fruit growers and members of a significant agriculture and farming family who settled in Sedona in the 1920s. Fruit grown on the farm was shipped throughout the Verde Valley as well as to Flagstaff, Seattle, San Francisco, St. Paul, Minnesota, New York, England and Thailand.

The farmstead of Walter and Ruth Jordan was among the last of the original farmlands within what is now the City of Sedona. When the Jordans stopped commercial fruit production in 1973, they sold off all but the last 3.75 acres of their land.

However, Ruth Jordan and the Sedona Historical Society recognized that this property had the potential for a municipal historical park and museum. Mrs. Jordan offered the land for sale to the newly incorporated City of Sedona, with the condition that it be dedicated to the preservation of Sedona's history.

Proposal

A letter of intent from the Red Rock Arts Council (RRAC) was originally submitted with an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness before it was determined that the City and not the lessee should be the applicant for a city-owned property. The City did not initiate the solicitation and donation of the sculpture for Jordan Historical Park; however, it is acting as the applicant.

Nevertheless, the RRAC letter of intent expresses their desire to donate and install an art sculpture "that will celebrate the teaching of local history by pioneers" in the form of a cowboy. The sculpture is intended to "encourage and attract interaction and photo-taking opportunities with visitors" to the Park. The letter also states that additional life-size sculptures of children will be added later.

The proposed location for the sculpture is adjacent to the east-facing side of the Walter and Ruth Jordan House in a landscaped area as reflected in the photographs submitted with the Application.

The Board of Trustees of the Sedona Historical Society approved the acceptance of the sculpture at their June 14, 2011 meeting.

Consistency with Land Development Code

The Sedona Land Development Code outlines the basis for commission review and decision on matters pertaining to a Certificate of Appropriateness in Article 15, §1509.03. This information has been provided at the end of the staff report.

The Secretary of the Interior's "Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings" will also be primary source for evaluating the proposed project. These national standards are referenced in the City of Sedona's Land Development Code, Article 15, § 1509 (A) and §1509.03 C.1.b and are to be used by the Commission in its review and decision on this proposal. Relevant excerpts from the Standards are cited below.

Staff also conferred with state architect Bob Frankeberger of the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) on this proposal.

The Sedona Art in Public Places Committee, the Arts and Culture Commission, and the Parks and Recreation Commission will also review this proposal within their respective programmatic areas following the Historic Preservation Commission's public hearing.

U. S. Department of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation*

Alterations/Additions for the New Use – Not Recommended:

Introducing any new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color, and texture; which destroys historic relationships on the site; or which damages or destroys important landscape features.

Standard # 3: Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

Standard # 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard # 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Staff Recommendation

This proposal is unlike any other that has been brought before the Historic Preservation Commission regarding Jordan Historical Park. It is different because it asks us to examine the relevancy, historical consistency, compatibility and significance of a new piece of sculptural art to an important historical site. The sculpture is being proposed in close proximity to the Jordan House.

A narrow and strict interpretation of the language contained in the City's Land Development Code and the U.S. Department of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation would lead us to conclude that the bronze sculpture of a cowboy may not be compatible with nor relate to the Jordan buildings and Jordan family story. It also would not complement the context of the landscape including the remnants of the fruit orchards that exist today.

The proposed cowboy sculpture does, however, reflect the broader mission of the Sedona Historical Society and the Sedona Heritage Museum to research, preserve and teach the history of the greater Sedona area. While the museum is "focused on the period from 1876 to the present-- the lifestyles and works of the people who pioneered this community, and on Sedona's first industry, raising apples and peaches", it has provided exhibits on cowboys and local cattle ranching. The sculpture would undoubtedly appeal to our many U.S. and international visitors who want to learn about the great Southwest and its cowboy legends, perhaps the driving force behind the sculpture's inception and proposed use as a photographic opportunity.

The sculpture would not adversely affect the listing on the National Register of Historic Places as it probably would not be interpreted as introducing "new history" to the site, but rather a "storyteller". The sculpture as storyteller would be further expressed with the proposed addition of children's figures that might be added in the future. The existing buildings can still convey the significance of their own story and the integrity of the site is not lost. And because there is no real adverse affect, it could be viewed only as a "minor distraction" according to Bob Frankeberger at SHPO.

If there is a compromise to be struck between the two extremes of placing the sculpture or not at all, it is probably in the careful selection of its actual placement on the site. Would it be better to distance it from the historic Jordan House and the other two buildings and locate it in another area of the park?

A site visit will assist the Commission in its evaluation of the proposed sculpture and location.

Possible Motion for Commission Consideration:

I, (Commission member), move to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the Jordan Historical Park CA11-02 (Historic Register Nos. 01, 02, and 03) for the addition of a life-size bronze sculpture of a cowboy consistent with the Sedona Land Development Code. Article 15, §1509.

Land Development Code, Article 15, Historic Preservation Ordinance

§1509.03 Commission Review and Decision

A. It is the intent of this article to ensure, insofar as possible, that properties designated as a landmark or a property within an Historic District shall

be in harmony with the architectural and historical character of the property or district.

B. When reviewing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Commission may approve, conditionally approve or deny a Certificate of Appropriateness based on the following:

1. The proposed work does not detrimentally alter, destroy or adversely affect any architectural or landscape feature; and
2. The proposed work will be compatible with the relevant historic, cultural, educational or architectural qualities characteristic of the structure, or district and shall include but not be limited to elements of size, scale, massing, proportions, orientation, surface textures and patterns, details and embellishments and the relationship of these elements to one another; and
3. The proposed work conforms with review guidelines and/or other applicable criteria.
4. The exterior of any new improvement, building or structure in a designated Historic District or upon a landmarked site will not adversely affect and will be compatible with the external appearance of existing designated buildings and structures on the site or within a Historic District.

C. Review guidelines and criteria.

1. The Commission may utilize the following documents and criteria as guidelines when considering an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

- a. Approved design guidelines for a designated Historic District.
- b. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
- c. Secretary of Interior's Preservation Briefs and other information developed by US Department of Interior Park Service, Arizona Historic Preservation Office, National Trust for Historic Preservation, National Alliance of Preservation Commissions, Association of Preservation Technology, and the Old House Journal.
- d. Any other guidelines as adopted by the city.

D. No change shall be made in the approved plans of a project after issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness without resubmittal to the Commission and approval of the change in the same manner as provided.

E. A Certificate of Appropriateness expires 6 months from the date of issuance unless work is started within that time.

F. If work exceeds that specified in the Certificate of Appropriateness, the Certificate of Appropriateness shall be revoked.

G. The Certificate of Appropriateness required by this article shall be in addition to any other permit(s) or review required for the proposed project.

Source:

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring & Reconstructing Historic Buildings. U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, Cultural Resource Stewardship and Partnerships, Heritage Preservation Services. Washington, D.C. (1995)