

Summary Minutes
City of Sedona
Historic Preservation Commission Special Meeting
Vultee Conference Room, 102 Roadrunner Drive, Sedona, Arizona
Monday, October 6, 2014 – 4:00 p.m.

(5 minutes, 4:00 - 4:05 pm for items 1 - 2)

1. Verification of notice, call to order, Pledge of Allegiance, roll call

Roll Call:

Commissioners Present: Chair Brynn Burkee Unger, Vice Chair Ann Jarmusch – arrived at 4:08 p.m., and Commissioners Allyson Holmes, Charlie Schudson and Steve Segner. Commissioner Jane Grams was excused.

Staff Present: Nicholas Gioello, Audree Juhlin and Donna Puckett

Council Liaison Present: Dan McIlroy

2. Commission and Staff announcements

Chair Unger announced that interviews were conducted last week and with Council approval, we will have Allyson Holmes back on the Commission for three years, as we do Ann Jarmusch. The Council approval should be considered on October 14th. We also have a new member, Robert Albrecht, and he will also be a good addition to the Commission with City Council approval.

3. Discussion only regarding possible rehabilitation/renovation/preservation work on Historic Landmark #20, Nininger House, located at 39 Meteor Drive, Sedona. New property owners are working with architect Howard Madole, original architect of the home, to address deteriorated conditions through rehabilitation, renovation and preservation work. Mr. Madole and the property owners wish to meet with the Commission to discuss possible ideas. (45 minutes, 4:05-4:50)

Chair Unger introduced this agenda item and explained this is not for a conclusion today; this is for the Commission to understand what we will be looking at and making a decision about, when it comes to a hearing. She, Commissioner Segner and Audree Juhlin met with the current homeowner, Megan Smith, and Howard Madole, Architect, to discuss what Megan had planned on having Mr. Madole oversee.

The Chair referenced the blueprints for the Commissioner's review and indicated that they show Howard Madole's concepts of what they plan to do. On the left side, it shows the exterior elevation and what they plan to do in replacing the current siding on the home, plus some of the details and colors. On the right side, there is a beak that they are planning to put on the beams that extend beyond the home to protect them, so they will not deteriorate further.

Note: Vice Chair Jarmusch joined the meeting at this time.

Chair Unger explained that the exterior of the building has deteriorated beyond plain repair, so Howard is planning to resurface the side of the building using a different color, and then on the right-side, it shows a beak that he plans. You can see the existing beams, and they will put a beak over the top to protect the ends of the beams, which are deteriorating radically. The cover is needed so they can be maintained and retained. The other note is that we have the original drawings of the home from Howard, and if you see these originals, the building now has board and batten on the outside. The original drawings don't look like all of it was board and batten. Some of it was intended to be a vertical line too. The Chair then indicated that when they met with Howard, he explained his concerns about the building, so he can describe his plans for you.

Howard Madole, Architect: Howard indicated that he knew Dr. Nininger, and the first building he was paid a commission for was the Meteorite Museum on the main street of Sedona, and then he was asked to do Dr. Nininger's house, and the man he was working with was out of their office. Dr. Nininger did what he wanted to do, when he wanted to do it. Originally, the whole exterior of the house was supposed to have a wood siding, and they wanted to put that wood siding over concrete, and he said that was not what he would have done, but anyhow that is what they did. So, some of the house has an old, old detail they never really finished out, and his idea is if you are going to do something to the house, let's do something that makes the house look proper.

Howard stated that Dr. Nininger had added on to the carport and done all sorts of things, taken all sorts of licenses, so he could play architect on his own house, which he has the right to do, but what he (Howard) is doing is not as severe as the drawings look. The shaded area, the charcoal color, the board and batten would be a green blue with a little bit of aluminum showing, just to give it a little sparkle. Aluminum is not a proper term; it'd be in blue or blue green. The windows on this house are old sliding windows, and he would like to replace them in black. He would like to replace the windows and put the charcoal around the windows, so it enhances the window and shows them off better. One of the fallacies in all of this is, and it is on the roofing situation. They made some very inadequate repairs to some of the structural problems with the roof, when they tried to carry this into the 2x6 fascia, and he would like to put the fascia back in and a channel; you can't tell one from the other, but it would be structurally sound and the roof will always look straight; it won't look like it is ready to fall down; that is the only way it can be held.

Howard indicated that the contractor is here and he would like to work with him and the Commission, and do this house so we are proud of it. Right now, it is a mess. Dr. Nininger had some details, and Brandmeyer is the man that worked with him; he was really the one that dictated a lot of this that happened. Howard then asked if there are any of his details that the Commission would like for him to explain. We have the interior design lady here today – Jennifer with the Design Group.

Howard added that they are planning new cabinets made out of Cherrywood; the interior will be greatly enhanced. Right now, these will be all new cabinets and the house will be in much, much better condition. It will be a much better building for his client's home. Some of the exterior walls are masonry, some are wood, and some of the masonry has wood on it and some of it doesn't, and when this house was built, we didn't have heating here in Sedona. All we had was wall furnaces, no cooling. When Frank Lloyd Wright did the (audio unclear) homes in Chicago, he built them out of masonry, and he had air conditioning out of butane; masonry sweats. Wall furnaces and fireplaces are all we had when we first started, and so he advised his client that we can now put wood or wood veneer, over the outside of the wood plywood, stained, and the interior will have dry wall to keep it from sweating. The whole house will be re-carpeted, it will be all new hardware, new doors, and the house will be a much more presentable home. For him right now, he hates to have people think he did some of the things that were done there.

Commission's Questions, Comments and Concerns:

- Question as to if the windows to be replaced are aluminum-framed single pane now. Megan Smith indicated yes.
- Question as to if they are going to go back to that same look. Howard stated yes; it would not change the size and you would not be able to tell the difference.
- Comment that it doesn't matter what you do inside, so go for it. Also, we had a meeting on the telephone with the State, and the State brought up some pertinent facts that the other Commissioners should know, so if we get into how the State sees it, maybe we won't get caught into a lot of dialogue unnecessarily.

Chair Unger pointed out that she had wanted Howard to discuss his plans, because it is his design, and basically, if it wasn't Howard doing these changes, she wouldn't have considered it, because this is Howard's home, even though it may not be exactly what he had planned initially. She

wouldn't, under any other circumstances, be at all open to another architect saying this would be better.

Megan Smith explained that she didn't start out thinking she was going to change the outside of the home, because she knew it wasn't supposed to be changed, but when Howard started looking at the rotting beams outside, something clicked, and when she talked with him the next time, he had started sketching, so that is how come . . .

Chair Unger asked Megan if she is happy with the drawings Howard has presented, and Megan stated yes. The Chair explained that in speaking about this circumstance with Bob Frankenberger, who is the leading expert in SHPO in the State of Arizona, we again have brought up something that they have never been faced with before. For the most part, the architects whose homes are designated have passed away, and then no, you would never change that, so we have a circumstance that has never been faced before in the State. His thought was also her thought, but she wants feedback from the Commission. When this home was built, there were some changes made to it that were not Howard's, and as a consequence, from Bob Frankenberger's comments, what had been done was actually not something conducive that would have made a mid-century home. What Howard wants to do will actually bring it back into that kind of look. One of Bob's other comments was that one of the strongest points for us to landmark the home was because it was one of Howard Madole's homes, and that is something that is to be considered, in that any changes made by Howard would be one of the things that would come to the top of the list, and the fact that he is the architect on record.

The Chair explained that basically we were talking about, as a Commission, how we should manage change rather than oppose change. We have to understand what we are faced with, what the building is, and in each instance, when we have a hearing for a Certificate of Appropriateness, they are going to be different, and this one may be the most different one we will be faced with, but looking at his original drawings, a lot of that was not followed when the home was built, and the fact that it will actually more readily be identified as a mid-century home with this kind of siding, rather than the board and batten, moves it into another era, which was a mid-century home, so that current look was not the look that Howard intended. According to Bob Frankenberger, given all the circumstances, the State feels that this is something we should consider and grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for, but that doesn't mean that we shouldn't have a discussion here and that is the reason for this meeting.

Commissioner Segner stated that it was a good conversation, and one of the things that Bob brought up was that there were a couple of ways we could designate it – one was as a classic mid-century home freestanding in Sedona or as a Madole home, and we kind of said it was a little of both, but we really did it as a Madole home. We also have some other homes in town that we designated that are Madole homes. Bob's comment was, who are we to second guess the Architect on what that home should look like, since he is still with us and he is still designing, and if he was to bring it back to the design he originally had in mind, the design you would recognize as mid-century, that would be appropriate. The Commissioner added that his only comment would be that he personally had a question on the beak; it is like taking a '57 Chevy and adding another fin on it. It is just maybe a little much, so his feeling would be to tone it down just a hair, and that would just be a comment.

Howard Madole asked Jennifer Aderhold, with the Design Group, to comment. Jennifer indicated that Mike Bower stated that Howard should be able to do what he wants on the home. The beam ends are cool and an embellishment, but it is something he sees for the home and as the architect, we should let him do what he wants. Howard then indicated that he would be the first to say this would embellish the beams. If you look at all the beams in all the homes here in Sedona, they are all a piece of junk with a piece of metal over the top to keep them from sliding. He wants to coat the top of those beams and take irrigation canvas and embed it into the coating, and take all that metal off, then the decoration that he wants to do will add to the look. He has done it one other time in

New Mexico and it was pretty attractive, but the beams will not continue to fall apart. Right now, if you don't do something to those beams, they are going to fall apart and ruin the whole house.

Commissioner Segner agreed that the beams need to be protected and Chair Unger also expressed her agreement, because we have had issues with other beams, and her comment has been that if they deteriorate, you can't cut them off and put another piece on them. The Chair then asked the other Commissioners for their comments.

Howard Madole indicated that it is hard to show you what they are really going to do, but he would recommend that he come here and spend a day or two with the contractor, and he could build one wall with his details, and put the detail on one beam, and then see what the Commission thinks of it. Commissioner Segner explained that gets too involved in the process, and Chair Unger added that her feeling is that if the Commission makes the decision that you are going to do this, then we allow you to do it. If your determination is, at a certain point, that it is not what you want to do, you will have to come back to us. Howard stated that he would not change it; he just thought it would accommodate you people.

Chair Unger thanked Howard, but explained that her feeling is that if we make a decision, it is better to leave it as it stands, rather than having Howard do a model mock-up. Audree Juhlin noted that the Commission can't make the decision today, so it is by consensus, and if you feel that is something necessary for the public hearing regarding the Certificate of Appropriateness, then you can ask for that, but if you don't feel it is necessary, then you can state that as well.

Commission's Comments, Questions and Concerns (continued):

- Question regarding the exterior material that will be charcoal-colored. Howard indicated that he intended for the walls to be 8 ft. high, and he would do plywood with a rough finish and put the plywood over the whole house, then put half of a 2x6, and it shows on those drawings, and the part above it is the (audio unclear) that will be charcoal; the rest will be stained a blue green. He has that on several of his homes here and that is what he has been doing here before. The windows we are going to replace, you wouldn't even know we replaced them; these windows are 56 years old and they weren't very good to start with, and for my client to spend that kind of money on this house, we want to make sure the house is going to last for her, and that it is a resellable item.
- Comment that we are extremely fortunate that Mr. Madole could undertake this project, and make maybe a new kind of landmark, but with his vision. She would definitely support him going ahead with the design proposal, and she visited Mr. Madole at his home in Prescott about a year ago, and spent several hours with him as he worked on his computer-assisted drafting machine and showed her his designs he was working on, and he was the most adept operator of that computer equipment, she has ever seen. In addition, he was verbalizing his ideas and he has the vision for this. It is frustrating, when an owner doesn't do it right the first time.

Howard commented that you had to know Dr. Nininger; he had a mind of his own.

- Comment that since this is upgrading this place to the way he originally wanted it, it is more than appropriate, and we are lucky to have this opportunity.

Howard stated that it is going to be so easy; it is amazing. The house will look so much better; it would be better to show it done properly. Dr. Nininger had stones against the walls; he put a wall in and he filled in the carport and stacked dirt against the masonry wall, which will leak through the masonry wall. It has a lot of problems, and they were not a part of his original, so he will correct it and bring it all up to a proper design.

- Comment regarding a concern that we will be setting a precedent here and every time we have a landmarked home and a world famous architect to design the home, 50 or 60 years later we will just rubber stamp it, but we'll just take our chances and roll the dice. We are in the

business of protecting and preserving history, but rarely do we get the chance to foster the continuing development of history, and what is anticipated here makes the property all the more extraordinary. It is fascinating and we are fortunate to have you here to give us the chance to do that.

Howard stated that would be his intent. How many more years he has on this Earth, he doesn't know. He wishes you could see what he is doing now.

Chair Unger thanked him and stated that Bob Frankenberger said that generally they don't like to landmark until the Architect is dead, because then they don't have to worry about this, but her comment was that we have a very young community, and he didn't discourage us totally from doing this. How many other architects we will be doing this for, we don't know, but there is a flaw in that, because if we didn't have these homes landmarked and people didn't understand that they were important, they would knock them to the ground and we would lose them, so even if it goes a little against the grain of SHPO for us to be landmarking homes, when the architect is still alive and working, it would still be something she would want to see us continue to do. He didn't say it was impossible for us to do it, and we are so young in this town, a lot of the buildings that we treasure are going to be architects who are still alive.

Howard indicated that design, as it was done originally, was light years ahead of what they did to that building, and Chair Unger indicated that Bob Frankenberger stated that landmarking it as a mid-century home by Howard Madole, what had been done to it really did not stand the landmark status, so he was fully in favor of it. She initially was concerned about what the State was going to say. Audree thought we possibly could de-landmark and re-landmark, but she would not rather do that. She would rather have this be part of that building's history, because once we get the Certificate of Appropriateness, all of this will go on record as part of what happened to that building over the course of its life as a landmark, so this is the most appropriate way we can take care of it.

Howard indicated that he appreciated that.

Councilor McIlroy indicated that he initially didn't realize "Howard" was the legendary Howard Madole; your reputation has preceded you. Howard responded that he has been called other things too. Councilor McIlroy then asked how many beams there are, and Howard indicated that there are three in the living room and probably three more that go out through the carport, plus some extensions that Dr. Nininger put on. He knows what he wants to do to them; they all need to be lengthened and he knows how to do that. There are six or eight beams overall. The Councilor then asked if he will be doing anything about the roof, and Howard indicated that the roof is not original. The 2x4 roof, and they cut it, and the 2x4s aren't structurally in place. They should have had it carry into the fascia; the fascia, they didn't even bother to nail it into the roof, so they had a structural failure and put pieces of metal up there, and he is going to replace all of that and give it structural strength. He wants to do the details in the roof; he has done it on all of his homes; it is a little detail and he thinks he has a drawing there, but it will strengthen the roof so it will not fall apart. It might last another 20 years, but right now, they just put a piece of metal up there and bolted it into the roof -- a six ft. long piece of metal, because it was not done structurally proper, when they first did it.

Megan Smith explained that if you look at the living room, he put the fireplace off-center, so the living room is off-center, and there are more 2x4s on one side than the other, and if you go outside the house, on that side the roof is bending, falling in, so they put up a piece of steel, but even the steel is bent, so that is what he wants to fix. Howard added that when it is finished; it should all be nice and straight.

The Councilor then asked Howard how many years he has practiced architecture. Howard stated that he was in the Navy, got out of the Navy, and went to school at the University of Iowa. He wanted to be a doctor, so he spent one year in medical school and found that he

could not tolerate Ether; it made him violently ill. So, he got out of medical school, and after 5½ years of college credits, he thought he would go back down to Sedona where his father and mother were and see what he could do. The Goodrow brothers were here and they had a little contracting business, and they have him half of it, which was like getting half of nothing, and that is where he learned to saw a 2x4 in two, without cutting his leg off. He had a man working for him, and his name was George Allan. His family started the Allan Floral Company in Prescott, and they are still there. He could not keep George sober long enough to get his work done, so he started doing his work for him nights, and a friend of his had motors, and he (Howard) had a drawing board where the friend showed all his old tires, and that is where he started out with a C-square, a triangle and a standard wood pencil. Then in 1952, he had 52 full-time employees working for him for several years, and a bookie ran off with \$85,000 of his money and broke him. He paid all his bills, but one bill to (audio unclear) and it finally got paid, and he settled back down in Sedona. Dr. Nininger said that he would like to have an art museum, and he did the Rigby Home in Sedona and several things around here. The Board of Technical Registration said that they wanted to give him his national registration, and to do that, he had to go to Phoenix and spend two years as a licensed architect, which he did. In 1972, he took his examination with Frank Lloyd Wright; he passed and Frank didn't. It took 75 to pass and that is what he had. At any rate, in 1972, they gave him his registration and had a big party, and in 1974, he won the Award for the Best Concrete Design, and it is still the best looking building in Phoenix. One more thing, he has done hospitals, probably 40 or 50 farm homes and HUD apartments; he has done everything there is, even one church and he can't think of what he has not done, and today, his mind works better than it did back then.

- Question as to if Frank Lloyd Wright ever passed.

Howard stated no, they gave it to him. Howard knew Wesley Peters who worked with Mr. Wright, and he had a client that paid them to do a model of Frank Lloyd Wright's Usonian Home that he did in Chicago; this came apart, it was made out of foam board, and when you photograph it, you cannot tell it from the original down to all of Frank's details. It loaded into five North American moving vans and went on national tour and spent a month in the Smithsonian. It's now sitting back in the front yard of Taliesin West, but at the same time he was doing all of this, he was working with Wesley Peters who was doing a home in Sedona, and Wesley was married to Joe Stalin's daughter, and is one of Howard's friends where he lives now. She was five years old, when her family was being starved by Joe Stalin; Howard didn't know that. At five years of age, she witnessed cannibalism; that is how they lived, and there is a lot to learn about what is going on in this world right now, but he has had a wonderful career and a lot of fun.

Chair Unger explained that this was a work session, because we wanted to introduce this idea, since it is so novel. It wasn't like just painting or roofing a building or making a typical addition to a building. We decided that we would do this work session, so f the Commissioners would understand what we are facing here, but it will still need to go to a hearing. Audree Juhlin explained that staff will get with Megan Smith and get an application and all the needed information in order to move it forward. We're probably a couple of months out, because of the procedures and posting requirements. Commissioner Schudson indicated that is fine as long as we don't slow down the process.

Howard indicated that he is okay; he is doing the Sedona Fine Arts building, the Museum of Fine Arts, and it is an all glass building, you see completely through it, and the roof is white marble coming down onto the glass.

Chair Unger indicated she thought the Certificate of Appropriateness possibly could be done next month, and Audree Juhlin agreed that she can do the posting, but needs the information available for the public. Howard asked how long it would be before he could actually start work, and Audree indicated that they could through the Building Permit review at the same time. We probably would be looking at November 10th for the public hearing, if we can make all of the

deadlines, but there could be a special meeting the week before Thanksgiving perhaps. About four weeks is needed for the posting requirements. Megan indicated that November 24th is the week of Thanksgiving, and Commissioner Schudson and Vice Chair Jarmusch indicated that they might not be available. Commissioner Schudson indicated that he believes he would be available on November 17th.

Audree Juhlin noted that she is not sure that Megan needs to be present for the hearing, if there are others present who can represent her. It sounds as if we have a consensus to move this forward, so there may not be a lot of questions of the applicant. Howard indicated that he will come anytime, and Megan indicated that she would like to be present and will figure something out. Audree Juhlin will let the Commission know the date.

4. Discussion regarding future meeting dates and future agenda items (5 minutes, 4:50-4:55)

Chair Unger asked if there is a meeting next week and Audree Juhlin stated yes. The Chair then stated that the meeting will be at 4:00 p.m. Monday.

Howard expressed appreciation for the Commission's work and indicated that they should have lived here in 1947; there were maybe 300 people if you shook all the bushes. (Audio unclear). He was one of the six people who lived on this whole flat area, including Rainbow's End, which is now called Relic's. There were six of us and that includes the cowboy that lived in a log cabin house that has been torn down, and the Historical Society should have kept that. Of all the things they had, they should have kept that. His father bought Coffee Pot Ranch and it had 54 acres; he bought it for \$4,500, and a friend of his George Babbitt talked him into (audio unclear) it out of escrow -- \$4,500 for 54 acres. The other thing that was important in Sedona, Alma Bird ran the only bar in town, and George Jordan had the waterworks, and in the bar, if you ordered a drink with a water back, it was just filled with little worms that wiggled all over the place. That's why you drank your Bourbon on the rocks.

The Chair thanked everyone for coming.

5. Adjournment (4:55)

The Chair called for adjournment at approximately 4:55 p.m., without objection.

I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the actions of the Historic Preservation Commission in the meeting held on October 6, 2014.

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Administrative Assistant*

Date