

Draft Action/Summary Minutes
City of Sedona
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting
Vultee Conference Room, Sedona City Hall, Sedona, AZ
Monday July 12, 2010 – 4:00 pm

Note: Chairman Unger explained that since a quorum of the Commission was not in attendance no action would be taken today.

1. Verification of notice, call to order, roll call and Pledge of Allegiance.

There was no official call to order. Discussion began at 4:08 p.m. with Chairman Unger and Commissioners Pierce and Snyder present. Vice Chairman Ruland and Commissioner Wienges had been excused. Staff members present were Kathy Levin and Donna Puckett.

2. Public forum for items not on agenda. Limit of 3 minutes per presentation. (Note that the Commission may not discuss or make any decisions on any matter brought forward by a member of the public).

The Chairman asked if any member of the public wished to speak.

Stephen Thomiszer, Sedona, AZ: Indicated that he lives in the Chapel area and he is here on the invitation of Kathy Levin. He has applied to be one of the Commissioners and has a background in architecture. Having graduated from the School of the Art Institute of Chicago, he also attended the Graduate School of Architecture at IIT. Chicago is a Mecca for architectural greats like Frank Lloyd Wright and others, so he has always had a great interest in architecture. He is very intrigued by Sedona's extraordinary examples of folk architecture. Although the black and white pictures aren't the greatest in the book, he finds them extraordinary and he was hoping some Commissioner could give him a tour of some of them at a later time.

3. Consent agenda:
a. Approval of minutes of June 14, 2010 meeting.

There was no discussion on this item.

4. Commission and staff announcements and summary of current matters.

Kathy Levin announced that under the Small Grant Assistance Program, she just sent out a check for \$9,109 to the owners of the Humming Bird House, also known as the Hart Store, for the emergency grant that was provided, and she has just submitted a request for reimbursement to SHPO for roughly \$3,900 that was also for a grant for the emergency work done at the Hart Store. Additionally, one candidate for the HPC will be interviewed next Monday, and that was for the previous application period that closed. The public notice for the vacancy was reopened and that period will close on August 13th; we have one application from Mr. Thomiszer to date. Regarding our final budget adopted by the City Council for 2010-2011, we retained \$250 in Advertising; \$100 in Commission Support; \$1,000 in Supplies, although all supplies will be collapsed to the City level; \$4,000 in the Small Grant Assistance Program and \$400 in Transfer to Grant Match, which could be for a CLG conference scholarship, etc.

Chairman Unger indicated that it had been suggested by Commissioner Snyder that we go to a legal-size page for the Endangered Places brochure, which was more of a headache. She couldn't retain all six properties, but five were included. Copies of the expanded draft brochure were distributed and the Chairman indicated she would like for the Commissioners to review it at a later meeting. We had the Sedona's Most Endangered Places Purpose and Criteria on the back, but she had to add some information and decided that we should have something about why we create a local landmark and the difference between a local and state or national landmark. She isn't totally sold on the wording, but on the other side we ask for local historic landmarking on each one of them. This will be a four-fold brochure, but she still has to do a little work on the layout. We have also added the Sedona Art Barn and the Sedona Library, but she needs the date on the library. The rest of the information on the other three was included in the last brochure, although she tweaked it a bit, because a couple of things have happened that probably altered the potential solutions given. She came up with the wording for the Sedona Art Barn and the Sedona Library. The greatest significance for the library was the architect, Benny Gonzales, so she included a little history about him and the fact that this has his southwest influence in the shapes and openings, but she would welcome any suggestions. She didn't think we wanted much more wording, to prevent people from getting too overwrought with too much information. The Chairman indicated that if any Commissioner had any questions or comments, they could be referred to her or Kathy. This brochure has been done annually and it is one of our more important ways of making the public aware of endangered buildings. She met with Janeen Trevillyan who indicated that we really needed to look at the art barn, because there is a possibility that they will tear it down. This is the way we actually get the word out and we can also have an article in the newspaper, but she would rather have the Commission solid on how this looks before doing that. The library is for sale and if it sells, it also may be knocked down, and we have used this brochure for the great benefit of the Madole-Rigby House and Elmer & Lizzie Purtymun House.

The Chairman also indicated that the CD she previously distributed to the Commission in the last meeting had a mistake, so she will either distribute a new copy in the next meeting or leave it in the Commissioners' boxes before then.

Commissioner Pierce announced that he is taking new photographs of the 22 historic landmarks and going through the files to see what old photographs we have, with the objective of having an old and new photograph of each landmark. He has already photographed 17 properties and the CD contains three files; first, one through fifteen except for #4 Saddlerock Ranch, which is managed by Deborah K. Newman who will provide a professional photograph. He only found four or five of the one through fifteen properties that had old photographs. It was a little difficult for #16A and B, which is the Owenby Ditch, because there is the map number, survey number, and City landmark number. He saw Soldiers Wash, but he wasn't sure if that was part of the Owenby Ditch, so there is a question mark. He took pictures of the ditch at 95 and 105 Portal Lane; 95 is right where the hotel starts, and if you go about 20 more feet, there is a new age religious center that has water in a side yard, so he photographed that as well. He also went to the City's wastewater lift station. Kathy Levin started describing the location of the ditch for him, but was reminded this item was for announcements only. Commissioner Pierce continued to say that he also photographed the H.H. Nininger home; although he couldn't decide between two photographs. He has taken about 7 photographs of each and chose the one he thought was best, but he included two photographs of the Nininger home.

Commissioner Pierce also announced he got a copy of Arizona's Little Hollywood that came out in March of 2010, because it said it had an extensive bibliography of photographs, and he thought we might find older photographs than we have in our files, plus he had discussed doing a short

documentary on the western film period in Sedona, and he thought the book may also help him on that. Deborah K. Newman indicated that she is especially interested in the Ellingers who used to own the house, but hobnobbed with some of the people in the movies, and she is interested in discussing that with the Commission.

Commissioner Helen Snyder referenced the July 2nd article in the newspaper about the art in the roundabouts and indicated that it was very interesting, because it specified some of the criteria, which had been one of her questions. There was also an article on Open Meeting Laws which was interesting as a new Commissioner.

No legal action was taken.

5. Discussion/possible action on FY 2010-11 Commission Work Plan and commissioner involvement in Work Plan tasks:

a. Education and Public Outreach

Chairman Unger indicated that Commissioner Pierce's announcement covered what she had to say, since she considers what we are doing for the webpage to be part of the public outreach.

No legal action was taken.

b. Survey Field Work

Chairman Unger indicated this is one item that the Commission needs to address in the fall, to look at some of the things we haven't been able to look at. Next month's meeting will be focused on the public hearings, but she hopes to look at this item in September.

No legal action was taken.

c. Madole Home landmark prospects

Chairman Unger indicated she was told that one of her friends may be renting the Gillenwater's home, so she may get a better understanding of what is going on with that in the future. Kathy Levin added that she had received a call from the owner indicating there was a contract on that home. The Chairman stated that is one of the better maintained Madole homes in Sedona.

No legal action was taken.

d. Early Don Woods-designed homes

There was no discussion on this item.

e. Arizona Centennial 2012 (February 14, 2012)

Chairman Unger reported that the new Commissioners didn't have anything that could be done this month. Vice Chairman Ruland was supposed to arrange a meeting with the high school principal, and she and her husband were on the front page of the newspaper touring the new performing arts center, and it was amazing. It is set-up for solar panels to feed the whole thing, and it is currently at the silver LEED level and going to gold LEED. We should discuss some production in that facility for the centennial. Vice Chairman Ruland hasn't reported back to her

about a meeting with the school, and she wasn't able to talk to the principal during the tour. She also doesn't know if Vice Chairman Ruland has talked with Nancy Robb Dunst; however, she and Kathy met with Ginger Wolstencroft about the art in the roundabouts, so they have a pretty good idea of what will happen going forward. It looks like it will be something that we can do as a Legacy Project. Kathy explained that she has started a draft application to nominate the roundabout art as a Legacy Project centennial activity, and Commissioner Wienges will review the draft with her. The Chairman added that we will need photographs, etc., because they will probably want more information, including some interviews with people and possibly updates as it progresses.

Chairman Unger indicated that she has a call into Goldenstein, and she needs to talk with Mei Wei Wong about the art barn and any art groups that might be interested in getting involved with the centennial. She, Kathy and Commissioner Wienges have attended the Sedona Events Alliance's meetings and will be again; they have one this month, but she doesn't think there would be time in that meeting to discuss the centennial. She did find out that Prescott is leading the state with the first big thing in a city, probably because Prescott was the original Capitol of Arizona, so their big event will be in September. Tucson will have a big event in October, and so far none of the other cities have provided a date. Phoenix and Arizona will probably do it in February of 2012. The county's website has an events calendar and once we get some of these dates together, she will make sure they get Sedona's dates on their calendar, because they are pushing this more than any other county in the state. Their website at Yavapai County Arizona Centennial is very interesting. Right now there is only one Legacy Project listed, so she would like to list Sedona's with them too. The other Legacy Project is oral histories by residents of Camp Verde, Beaver Creek and the Yavapai-Apache Nation, and the Nation's cultural center will provide an oral history demonstration at the committee's next meeting, so they can make a decision on that.

The Chairman indicated that Janeen Trevillyan suggested that we do something at the Chapel of the Holy Cross and Kathy has asked when that might hit national landmark designation, so we are hoping we can do something for the centennial event. Again, the celebrations for the centennial will begin in September of 2011 and go through the state's centennial birthday on February 14, 2012. One suggestion that we may act on next time is that Councilor Litrell suggested that along with Sedona's Century, we tag on "Sedona, Arizona's Sweetheart". We can't put that on until the Commission can vote on the wording for the Centennial, but it is very clever.

No legal action was taken.

6. Discussion/possible action on:
a. Prospects for designation of landmarks or historic districts

Kathy explained that two prospects will be going to public hearing on August 16th, which is not the Commission's regular meeting day. One is the proposed local historic designation of the Van Ess home located on Zane Grey Drive and the other is a review under the Certificate of Appropriateness process for the Jordan Historical Park, for rehabilitation work on the barn and residence. The Commission will do a site visit of both properties at 2:30 p.m. and receive a Staff Report in advance of the hearing. In the public hearing process, the Chairman will ask staff to make a presentation, and then the Commission may ask questions of staff. It would then be opened to the applicant to speak, and in the case of the Jordan Historical Park, the Director of Parks & Recreation may speak, because it is a City-owned park. Then, anyone in

the public who wishes to speak would have an opportunity until the Chairman closes the public comment period and turns the discussion back to the Commission for additional questions and comments. Following discussion, one or more of the proposed motions could be chosen.

Chairman Unger explained that proposed motions are in the Staff Report, so there is a chance to look at them, even if you want to change the wording. She also explained that generally the Chairman doesn't make the motions. Kathy added that the Commission should meet at City Hall at 2:30 p.m. to go together to see both properties, and then return for the 4:00 p.m. public hearing in Council Chambers.

Commissioner Snyder asked if that is part of a Council meeting and Chairman Unger indicated no, it is the Commission's meeting. Kathy explained that the Commission is normally in the chambers for public hearings, to formalize it. Commissioner Snyder referenced a prior meeting when a house being designated was discussed at a Council meeting. Kathy explained that the Commission always makes the decision; it doesn't go to Council. The Chairman suggested that Commissioners read through the paperwork prior to the hearing, and if you want clarification on something, call Kathy. Kathy noted that she will be gone the first two weeks of August, so all of the work will be done by the end of this month. The Chairman added that there will be time for Commissioners to ask questions at the hearing, and most of the time the neighbors who attend are supportive, so it is an interesting process.

Commissioner Helen Snyder asked when these were first applied for; does it take about a year or six months? Kathy indicated that she thinks it was in the late winter, when we did a survey of the property. Helen indicated she was there for the survey of the Van Ess home; Kathy pointed out that before that, there had been interest expressed by the property owner and a former Commissioner had developed a relationship with the property owner, so from beginning to end, the process might have been about six months, but it could take three years from the time you first start talking to a property owner about landmarking their home. From the time of the application to the public hearing is about three months.

Chairman Unger indicated that it had been a little longer for the Jordan Historical Park, and Kathy explained that there was a building condition assessment done by Otwell & Associates, an architectural firm and historic preservation specialist in Prescott, and that assessment is almost two years old. On the basis of that assessment, she prepared a couple of heritage grants for the rehabilitation proposed for the two structures, but the funding dried up. On the basis of that analysis and the assessment report, a portion of this work was budgeted by the City in the 2010-2011 budget. She doesn't yet have their specifications, but it is all exterior work on the barn and house, and it should be called out very carefully. Your review doesn't have anything to do with the interior, but any exterior work will be spelled out in the specifications attached to the Staff Report.

Chairman Unger explained that if there is something we don't understand, we would refer it to SHPO and ask for their opinion. Of the two, the rehabilitation work will be the hardest, because we have to decide if the materials are appropriate, etc., so if you have any questions call her or Kathy. A lot of the people there have been Commissioners, but that doesn't always mean they catch everything.

Kathy explained that in addition to receiving the Staff Report, we also post the property, so the neighbors know there will be a public hearing, and a letter is sent to all residents within 300 ft.,

so they can attend and contact her if they have any questions. We also put a notice of public hearing in the newspaper, which are all requirements of the Land Development Code.

Chairman Unger indicated that information on the public hearing process is on the CD, and that is the process the Commission will follow for both of the public hearings. Kathy stressed that it also will be very important that motions are clear, because Donna Puckett won't be present, so we want to be very mindful that if you are going to modify any of the proposed motions that it is very clear.

Commissioner Helen Snyder asked if they would be there as Commissioners or as part of the public and Kathy explained that they are the Commission and the Commission is hearing the matter. Chairman Unger added that the public will have an opportunity to ask questions as well as the Commission. In any hearing, we always want to ensure that all of our requirements are met and that is also discussed on the CD. Kathy added that the Staff Report includes the criteria that your decisions are based on, and there is a staff recommendation. You can also review Section 15 in the Land Development Code, but it will all be in the Staff Report.

Commissioner Helen Snyder asked if the public hearing requires a quorum of the Commission and Kathy indicated yes, and if we don't have a quorum, the Commission can't hear that item. Chairman Unger noted that Commissioner Wienges will be back next month and we may have our new member. Kathy indicated that she will check Council's meeting schedule.

No legal action was taken.

b. Certificates of Appropriateness

There was no discussion on this item.

c. Updates to Historic Resource Survey

There was no discussion on this item.

d. Condition of Landmarks or other historic properties

Commissioner Pierce indicated that the Gassaway House is shown as abandoned in the Resource Survey, and when you go there, there is a chain-link fence, but you can walk through it; however, he photographed it from the roundabout. He then asked what is happening with that and Kathy explained that a residential subdivision was approved for that area, and the Gassaway House was going to be used as a private residence, but she doesn't know its current status; that status of vacant or abandoned was probably in the original survey. Commissioner Pierce indicated it was survey #26 and it says the current use is vacant. Chairman Unger indicated it was resurveyed June 10, 2007; however, before that it was 1991. Kathy added that it has been vacant for a very long time, but that doesn't mean it is ownerless; perhaps a better term would be that it is not in use. Commissioner Pierce asked if he could walk up to it and Kathy explained that it should be considered private property. It would be better to identify the owner and tell them the purpose for which you want to go on the property. Commissioner Pierce asked about the condition of it and Kathy indicated she was in there about 12-18 months ago and it was good. The Chairman added that they also haven't altered a lot of it. Kathy indicated that one of the best stewards is a woman who lives on a neighboring property, and she suggested that the Commissioner get with her to see if some contact information can be

determined. Commissioner Pierce indicated that so far everything he has photographed looked good, except for not being able to tell where the Owenby Ditch was. The other properties have a plaque, so he wondered what designates the ditch. Kathy indicated that it is Landmark 16 A-H or I, and each one has a plaque. The Chairman suggested that he talk with Steve Segner, a former Commissioner, and Kathy pointed out that they are keeping the ditch free-flowing, which is important as an agricultural ditch that continues to be used for landscaping, etc. The Chairman also noted that there are other ditches in Sedona as well, but after they haven't been used for a long time, it is harder to designate them. Commissioner Pierce indicated that at 105 Portal Lane, the water wasn't underground, and Kathy described where he should be able to see an open part of the ditch in the parking lot of Tlaquepaque on the west side and she thinks they landmarked 10 ft. from the center line on each side.

No legal action was taken.

7. Discussion/possible action regarding future meeting dates and future agenda items.

Kathy indicated the next meeting will be on August 16th with the site visits beginning at 2:30 p.m., and the regular meeting starting at 4:00 p.m. The Chairman asked that the Commissioners also review the draft brochure before the next meeting.

8. Adjournment.

Discussions ended at 5:10 p.m.

I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission held on July 12, 2010.

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Recording Secretary*

Date